BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 03320 3068

LAW REVIEW SEMINAR:

FIRST NATIONS, SOVEREIGNTY, AND THE CANADIAN STATE

VOLUME I

Patrick Macklem
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

1991

Prepared with the assistance of John Borrows

141 - 193
BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
AUG 23 1991
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

LAW REVIEW SEMINAR:

FIRST NATIONS, SOVEREIGNTY, AND THE CANADIAN STATE

VOLUME I

Patrick Macklem
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

1991

Prepared with the assistance of John Borrows

Printed on
Recycled Paper

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/lawreviewseminar01mack

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I

Page

I. INTRODUCTION: CULTURAL DIFFERENCE AND THE COURTS

1. Robin Ridington, "Cultures in Conflict: The Problem of Discourse, [1990] Canadian Literature 273..... 1

2. Delgamuukw v. British Columbia, Plaintiffs' Opening Address, May 11, 1987, reported at [1988] 1 C.N.L.R. 14..... 10

3. Delgamuukw v. British Columbia (1991), 79 D.L.R. (4th) 185 (B.C.S.C.)..... 69

4. Oren Lyons, "Traditional Native Philosophies Relating to Aboriginal Rights," in Boldt & Long, eds., The Quest For Justice: Aboriginal Peoples and Aboriginal Rights (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1985), 19-23..... 84

II. SETTLEMENT, CONQUEST, TREATIES, AND COLONIZATION

1. Kevin J. Worthen, "Sword or Shield: The Past and Future Impact of Western Legal Thought on American Indian Sovereignty" (Review Essay of Williams Jr., The American Indian in Western Legal Thought) (1991), 104 Harv. L. Rev. 1372..... 87

2. Patrick Macklem, "Ethnonationalism, Aboriginal Identities and the Law," in Levin, ed., Ethnonationalism: Canadian and International Perspectives (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, forthcoming)..... 98

3. James Frideres, "Policies on Indian Peoples in Canada," in Li, ed., Race and Ethnic Relations in Canada (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1990) 98-119..... 129

4. Patrick Macklem, "First Nations Self-Government and the Borders of the Canadian Legal Imagination" (1991), 36 McGill L.J. 382, 425-445..... 139

5. George Stanley, "An Historical Comment," in Getty & Lussier, eds., As Long As the Sun Shines and Water Flows (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1979) 1-24..... 159

Page

III. FIRST NATIONS SOVEREIGNTY: ABORIGINAL PERSPECTIVES

1. Menno Boldt & J. Anthony Long, "Tribal Traditions and European-Western Political Ideologies: The Dilemma of Canada's Native Indians," in Boldt & Long, eds., The Quest For Justice: Aboriginal Peoples and Aboriginal Rights (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1985), 333-346..... 160

2. Robert A. Williams Jr., "Gendered Checks and Balances: Understanding White Patriarchy in an American Indian Cultural Context" (1990), 24 Georgia L. Rev. 1019..... 168

3. Interview with Kahn-Tineta Horn, "Beyond Oka: Dimensions of Mohawk Sovereignty" (1991), 35 Stud. Pol. Econ. 29..... 182

4. Gayaneshakgowa: Great Law of Peace: The Constitution of the Iroquois Confederacy, reproduced in Baxendale & MacLaine, eds., This Land Is Our Land: The Mohawk Revolt at Oka (Montréal: Optimum, 1991), 99-121..... 189

5. Harold E. Driver, Indians of North America (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1961), 269-277, 283-285.... 212

IV. CURRENT CONSTITUTIONAL JURISPRUDENCE

1. R. v. Sparrow, [1990] 3 C.N.L.R. 160 (S.C.C.)..... 223

2. Michael Asch & Patrick Macklem, "Aboriginal Rights and Canadian Sovereignty: An Essay on R. v. Sparrow" (1991), 29 Alberta L. Rev. 498..... 243

3. Mary Ellen Turpel, "Aboriginal Peoples and the Charter: Interpretive Monopolies, Cultural Differences" (1989), 6 C.H.R.Y.B. 3..... 253

4. Patrick Macklem, "Aboriginal Peoples, Criminal Justice Initiatives, and the Constitution," in Monture & Turpel, eds., Aboriginal Peoples and Canadian Criminal Law: Rethinking Justice (Law Reform Commission of Canada, forthcoming)..... 275

Page

V. ABORIGINAL SOVEREIGNTY REVISITED

1. Brian Slattery, "Aboriginal Sovereignty and Imperial Claims" (1991), 29 Osgoode Hall L.J. (forthcoming)..... 319

2. David Williams, "The Borders of the Equal Protection Clause: Indians as Peoples" (1991), 38 U.C.L.A. L. Rev. 759..... 342

3. Will Kymlicka, Liberalism, Community and Culture (Oxford University Press, 1991), 135-205..... 352

4. John Danley, "Liberalism, Aboriginal Rights and Cultural Minorities" (1991), 20 Philo. & Pub. Aff. 168.. 388

VOLUME II

VI. CONSTITUTIONAL REFORM IN THE 1980s

1. National Chief George Erasmus, "Twenty Years of Disappointed Hopes," in Richardson ed., Drumbeat: Anger and Renewal in Indian Country (Toronto: Summerhill, 1989), 1-42..... 397

2. Assembly of First Nations, "The Case For Indian Self-Government," presented to the First Ministers' Conference on Aboriginal Constitutional Matters, April 2 and 3, 1985..... 419

3. Chief Joe Mathias, "Statement at Meeting of Ministers," March 20, 1986..... 424

4. Chief Gary Potts, "Statement at Meeting of Ministers," March 20, 1986..... 429

5. Kathy Brock, "The Politics of Aboriginal Self-Government: A Canadian Paradox" (1991), 34 Can. Pub. Admin. 272..... 433

6. Louis Bruyere, "Aboriginal Peoples and the Meech Lake Accord" (1988), 5 C.H.R.Y.B. 49..... 447

7. J.E. Chamberlin, "Aboriginal Rights and the Meech Lake Accord," in Swinton & Rogerson, eds., Competing Constitutional Visions: The Meech Lake Accord (Toronto: Carswell, 1988), 11-19..... 463

Page

VII. CONSTITUTIONAL REFORM IN THE 1990s

1. David Hawkes & Bradford Morse, "Alternative Methods for Aboriginal Participation in Processes of Constitutional Reform," in Watts & Brown, eds., Options For A New Canada (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991), 161-187..... 468

2. Assembly of First Nations, "Where We Stand: AFN's Position on the Constitution," March 3, 1989..... 481

3. National Chief George Erasmus, Submission to the Special Joint Committee of Parliament on the Constitutional Amending Process, April 24, 1991..... 485

4. XXIIth Annual Chiefs Assmebly Resolution, First Nations Circle on the Constitution, June 10, 1991..... 503

5. Assembly of First Nations, Press Release, June 19, 1991..... 505

6. Assembly of First Nations, Press Release, July 8, 1991..... 507

7. Alan Cairns, "Constitutional Minoritarianism in Canada," in Watts & Brown, eds., Canada: The State of the Federation, 1990 (Kingston: Institute of Intergovernmental Relations, 1990), 71-96..... 509

8. Ronald Watts, "Canada's Constitutional Options: An Outline," in Watts & Brown, eds., Options For A New Canada (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991), 15-30..... 521

9. David Milne, "Equality or Symmetry: Why Choose?" in Watts & Brown, eds., Options For A New Canada (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991), 285-307..... 530

10. Alan Cairns, "Constitutional Change and the Three Equalities," in Watts & Brown, eds., Options For A New Canada (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991), 77-100..... 542

11. Charles Taylor, "Shared and Divergent Values," in Watts & Brown, eds., Options For A New Canada (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991), 53-76..... 555

Page

VIII. IMPLEMENTING SELF-GOVERNMENT: INSTITUTIONAL DESIGN

1. Richard Simeon, "Aboriginal Self-Government and Canadian Political Values," in Hawkes & Peters, eds., Issues in Entrenching Aboriginal Self-Government (Kingston: Institute of Intergovernmental Relations, 1987), 49-58..... 568

2. Frank Cassidy & Robert Bish, Indian Government: Its Meaning in Practice (Lantzville: Ooolichan, 1989), 29-50..... 573

3. Indian and Northern Affairs, Government of Canada, Indian Self-Government Community Negotiations (1989).... 585

4. "Chiefs Mapping Strategy," The Globe and Mail, July 11, 1991..... 606

5. Assembly of First Nations, Press Release, July 10, 1991..... 607

6. Roger Gibbins, "Citizenship, Political, and Intergovernmental Problems With Indian Self-Government," in Ponting, ed., Arduous Journey: Canadian Indians and Decolonization (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1988), 369-377..... 609

7. Frank Cassidy, "Aboriginal Governments in Canada: An Emerging Field of Study" (1990), 23 Can. J. Pol. Sci. 73..... 618

8. Noel Lyon, Aboriginal Self-Government: Rights to Citizenship and Access to Governmental Services (Kingston: Institute of Intergovernmental Relations, 1984), 48-69..... 633

9. C.E.S. Franks, Public Adimistration Questions Relating to Aboriginal Self-Government (Kingston: Institute of Intergovernmental Relations), 1987)..... 654

10. John Weinstein, Aboriginal Self-Determination Off a Land Base (Kingston: Institute of Intergovernmental Relations, 1986)..... 704

11. Alan Cairns, "Aboriginal Self-Government and Citizenship," a paper presented to the University of Toronto Legal Theory Workshop, April 24, 1987..... 733

Page

IX. IMPLEMENTING SELF-GOVERNMENT: CRIMINAL JUSTICE AND TRIBAL COURTS

1. Patricia Monture & Mary Ellen Turpel, "Aboriginal Perspectives on Justice in the Criminal Code," in Monture & Turpel, eds., Aboriginal Peoples and Canadian Criminal Law: Rethinking Justice (Law Reform Commission of Canada, forthcoming)..... 755

2. Frank Pommersheim, "The Contextual Legitimacy of Adjudication in Tribal Courts and the Role of the Bar as an Interpretive Community" (1988), 18 New Mex. L. Rev. 49..... 816

3. Michael Coyle, "Traditional Indian Justice in Ontario: A Role for the Present?" (1986), 24 Osgoode Hall L.J. 605..... 828

4. Tom Tso, "The Process of Decision Making in Tribal Courts" (1989), 31 Ariz. L. Rev. 225..... 843

5. Bryan Schwartz, "A Separate Aboriginal Justice System?" (1990), 28 Man. L.J. 77..... 849